

Board of Trustees
Human Resources / Labor Relations Committee

February 27, 2023

2:00 PM

ZOOM – No Physical Location is Available

The public is invited to view the meeting on YouTube. The link to the Board of Trustees YouTube page can be found the Board website: <https://www.maine.edu/board-of-trustees/>

AGENDA

2:00-2:25

Executive Session

The Human Resources & Labor Relations Committee will enter Executive Session under the provisions of: 1 MRSA Section 405 6-A & 6-D.

Following the Executive Session the Committee will reconvene the public meeting to discuss the following:

2:25-2:55

Public Meeting Agenda

TAB 1 [UMS Hiring Policies & Procedures Review Update](#)

Action items within the Committee purview are noted in green.

Items for Committee decisions and recommendations are noted in red.

Note: Times are estimated based upon the anticipated length for presentation or discussion of a particular topic. An item may be brought up earlier or the order of items changed for effective deliberation of matters before the Committee.

University of Maine System
Board of Trustees

AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

NAME OF ITEM: UMS Hiring Policies & Procedures Review Update

INITIATED BY: Beth Dobson, Chair

BOARD INFORMATION: X

BOARD ACTION:

BOARD POLICY:

N/A

UNIFIED ACCREDITATION CONNECTION:

N/A

BACKGROUND:

At the July 2022 Board of Trustees meeting Chancellor Malloy presented a summary of a preliminary UMS Employment Search Process Review. Following the July meeting, the Chair of the Board tasked the Human Resources & Labor Relations Committee to work with System Staff to complete a review of all UMS hiring policies and procedures and report back to the Board with findings and recommendations upon completion of the review.

Acting Vice Chancellor for Strategic Initiatives, Carolyn Dorsey, will provide an overview of the UMS employment search process review, the associated report, and any findings or recommendations based on the review.

2/16/2023

REVIEW OF UNIVERSITY OF MAINE SYSTEM HIRING PRACTICES

Prepared for

Beth Dobson

University of Maine System Board of Trustees, Chair of HR/LR Committee

Trish Riley

University of Maine System Board of Trustees, Board Chair

From

Carolyn Dorsey

University of Maine System Acting Vice Chancellor for Strategic Initiatives

February 16, 2023

Review of University of Maine System Hiring Practices

Background

The University of Maine System (UMS) Board of Trustees (BOT) requested a review of the hiring practices for all faculty, staff, and executive positions at the universities, center locations, and the UMS. The following report is compiled to understand current hiring practices and identify where there may be opportunities for improvement and investment.

Approach and Methodology

Conducting the work was a review committee led by Interim Chief Human Resources Officer Judy Ryan. The committee members included representatives from large and small campuses, University of Maine System staff internal and external to Human Resources (HR). The committee requested and reviewed information on hiring practices for faculty, staff, and executive positions from all seven universities and the law school, the various university center locations and the UMS. The methodology used included:

- Evaluation of current hiring practices at the University of Maine System and all its campus locations for all types of searches to include:
 - Temporary
 - Part-time
 - Full-time
 - Internal
 - External
 - Search waivers
 - Searches that utilize external search firms
- Review of relevant state and federal laws that govern hiring practices such as:
 - Child Labor
 - Substance Use Testing
 - Equal Pay
 - Independent Contractors
 - Minimum Wage & Overtime
 - Prevailing Wage
 - Affirmative Action
 - Compliance with bargained hiring practices such as posting timelines
- Interviews with internal stakeholders to include:
 - Executive Employment Lead who manages all searches for positions with a direct reporting line to the Chancellor. (Executive Employment is a category of positions that have a direct reporting structure to the Chancellor.)
 - All UMS campus HR leads
 - Relevant UMS HR Centers
- Interviews with colleagues at the following peer institutions and review of their publicly available information.
 - The University of Alaska System
 - The Montana University System

- The University of Wisconsin System
- Analysis of information gathered and identification of opportunities
- Development of recommendations

Context

The UMS HR department currently consists of 59 employees who are responsible either directly or tangentially for recruitment and retention of the System's 4,749 employees working across the state. While the total number of UMS employees has remained steady, the number of HR employees has decreased from 72 in 2015 to 59 in 2023 (a 16.4 percent decrease). In addition, it is important to note that the number of searches per year has gone from 737 in 2015 to 1,700 in 2022.

While a limited number of Associate Partners are solely responsible for the active administration of recruitment, HR employees at all levels of the campus HR organizations are involved with searches through oversight or direct approval of positions. The System Office of Human Resources, as found on the website, is described as the following:

The System Office of Human Resources leads and partners with the seven University of Maine System (UMS) universities and the University of Maine School of Law to meet the changing human resource needs of the University of Maine System, its faculty, and employees. Collectively our human resources provide the educational opportunities that transform students' lives and the research and outreach that contribute to the people and State of Maine.

Human Resources supports the recruitment, development, effective management, and retention of highly qualified faculty and employees through staffing, employee and labor relations, compensation, benefits, performance management, organization development, and equity and diversity programs and services.

Simply stated, this team is responsible for ensuring fair, legal, and respectful treatment of employees throughout all phases of their employment. Through thoughtful and inclusive recruitment practices, HR assists in evaluating and filling vacant positions, adapting to the needs of a changing and diverse workforce, reducing turnover, and improving employee morale.

Since the recruitment efforts of campuses and The University of Maine System are decentralized, a high level of communication and collaboration has developed between centralized HR services that maintain the software used in recruitment and the campus HR departments. Over time, UMS HR and campus teams have created a distributed recruitment process to meet the needs of UMS universities and internal and external applicants.

Current Standard Recruitment Process

Once a department is aware of a vacancy, HR is notified and helps to facilitate the next steps which are listed in the table below. Before beginning the search process, HR recommends that the search committee chair develop a search timeline and identify search committee team members who will assist in completed tasks within the software platform (HireTouch).

All search committee members then complete search training with the UMS Equal Opportunity (EO) office which discusses the committee's commitment to develop a diverse team that will create an inclusive environment through understanding bias obstacles inherent in social selection situations and best practices to maximize inclusion and minimize bias.

All ongoing positions are filled through a competitive search process. Internal searches may limit competitiveness as they are only available to current UMS employees. Recruitment efforts will be expanded to local, statewide, regional, or national outreach in scope based on criteria defined by Human Resources and the type of position needing to be either created or filled. Some circumstances, however, require some standard recruitment procedures be waived. For example, in the case of a trailing spouse or when the desired candidate possesses a unique skill set that benefits the University, the department may request a waiver of competitive search, which must be approved by the Chief Human Resources Officer (CHRO) or designee and comply with UMS policy and past practice.

Once a decision has been made regarding the scope of the search, tasks and procedures are completed by the responsible party as outlined and defined below. It is important to note that the following definitions and steps are consistent with the hiring process for all campuses.

Responsible Party	Process Steps	Notes
HR	Job Posting/Marketing Plan activated	Guidance: posting for 3-4 weeks depending on level of position – the sample time frame is on a three-week posting
UMS Equal Opportunity/ Search Committee	Search committee attends the next available Equal Opportunity Search training before taking any action in the search.	Training curriculum: Implicit bias, Diversity, and Inclusive Hiring Practices.
Assigned Role: (Search Chair/HR Rep/Advisor)	Review candidates for minimum qualifications and move forward in process for committee review.	This task should be completed daily.
Search Committee	Identify candidate pool for first interview, review proposed interview questions.	This should be scheduled within 1-2 days after the job closing.
Search Chair/HR	Update hiring authority on progress.	
Search Committee	Level One Interviews Conducted	This should take no longer than two weeks.
Search Committee & HR Rep	Debrief Level One, identify candidates for Level Two and determine modality to use.	
Search Chair/HR	Update Hiring Authority or invite them to the previous step.	
See Campus Itinerary	Level Two Interviews and any subsequent interviews or stakeholder meetings.	This could involve candidates with travel requirements. Every attempt should be made to complete in a 2-3 week timeframe.
Search Chair/Admin Support	Compile Assessment Feedback	

Search Committee/HR Rep	a) Discuss Finalists b) Agree on slate to present to hiring authority c) Send to hiring authority	Note: your protocols should say whether you are submitting a ranked or unranked slate to the hiring authority.
Search Committee/HR Rep/Hiring Authority	Meet & Discuss with Hiring Authority	Give the hiring authority 1-2 days to review the materials submitted in the previous step.
Hiring Authority/HR	Final reference checks; follow-up conversations with candidates.	
HR/Search Chair/Hiring Authority	Salary Approval form completed in HireTouch, Offer Letters, Background Checks	All search documentation collected from the search committee such as interview notes, rating sheets, etc, must be attached to the Salary Approval form. If issues are identified, and adverse action may result, BOT Policy 415 must be followed. Specifically, the supervisor/department head will consult with HR, conduct a review, and share findings from the review with the chair of the search committee and the hiring officer.
Hiring Authority	Update the Search Committee with search results.	

Through research and interviews with peer institutions, such as the University of Alaska System, the Montana University System, and the University of Wisconsin System, the following consistencies between them and UMS regarding best practices were found:

- The work is guided by an understanding that high-quality recruitment is vital, especially in tight labor markets in a competitive field. Therefore, solid hiring practices and proactive approaches are essential to the success of institutions.
- HR teams are dedicated to standard practices and policies with due diligence given to compliance with Federal and State laws.
- HR ensures successful outcomes of complex search processes that result in both a hire and a positive candidate experience for those not selected.
- Like UMS, The Montana University System Human Resources office is decentralized and does not dedicate any Full Time Employees (FTE) to recruitment and hiring.

Additionally, our research and interviews with peer institutions have uncovered the following differences between UMS regarding best practices:

- Most institutions have publicly shared websites with clear directives on hiring and recruitment best practices and resources to ensure compliant searches.
- Executive Employment is a primary function of HR and is not located within a separate department.
- The University of Alaska System and the University of Wisconsin System have centralized departments for recruitment and Executive Employment that provide resources and governance throughout their systems. The University of Alaska System has 4 FTE dedicated to these efforts and the University of

Wisconsin has 6 FTE.

Findings

1. Upon review, UMS HR hiring and recruitment has appropriate procedures in place to conduct successful hiring and recruitment searches, but they are not followed consistently with each search.
2. Upon review of peer institutions and a review of past UMS HR hiring and recruitment practices, that also includes Executive Employment, UMS HR is under-resourced and could benefit from additional staffing and funding.
3. The current application process that UMS HR utilizes for all hiring does not call for the applicant to self-disclose any information relevant to the successful outcome of a search, to include disclosure of prior investigations or votes of no confidence.
4. Current UMS HR hiring procedures are currently not available or easily accessible in UMS Administrative Practice Letters (APLs).
5. All UMS HR hiring policies and practices within the recruitment software HireTouch and UMS HR public webpage are unorganized and inaccessible to many who use the platform. This includes documents and policies that pertain to the Board of Trustees and governance from collective bargaining agreements (CBAs).
6. UMS HR has developed a robust collection of templates, step-by-step instructions, and best practice documents (such as a template providing appropriate interview questions) that provide a qualitative experience both for the candidate and the search committee member.

Recommendations

Policies, procedures, and accountability measures

1. A final review of BOT and HR recruitment and hiring policies and procedures will be completed. All information pertaining to HR services will be made accessible and available on the public UMS HR website. This will include transitioning Employee Relations Letters (ERLs) to Administrative Practice Letters (APLs) including any governance pertaining to Collective Bargaining Agreements (CBAs).
2. Develop a disclosure form for applicants that will be required for an application to be considered complete. This form will include questions regarding involvement in prior investigations of sexual assault/violence, votes of no confidence, other behavior misconduct and previous investigations or actions taken towards dismissal or reprimand.
3. All search committee members will be required to sign a confidentiality form and complete search training provided by the UMS EO office prior to serving on search committees.
4. All templates, instructions and best practice documents will be made fully available to all search committee members and chairs through the hiring and recruitment software HireTouch as well as through the UMS EO office prior to the completion of search committee training.
5. Prior to an offer being presented to a final candidate either the CHRO or designated HR team member will meet with the search committee chair to review the search committees process and documentation to ensure that all requirements are completed and compliant.
6. The Chief Human Resources Officer (CHRO) or designated HR team member will manage and track the change processes required of this review to ensure they are met in a timely manner.

Organizational and staffing measures

Based on the above recommendations, the following organizational and staffing options will be considered:

Option 1:

Adopt the policies, procedures, and accountability measures recommended above and evaluate current staffing shortfalls that will be needed to maintain these new recommendations. Maintain Executive Employment outside of the UMS HR office.

OR

Option 2:

Adopt the policies, procedures, and accountability measures recommended above and reassign Executive Employment to UMS HR with appropriate staff.

OR

Option 3:

Adopt all recommendations listed above AND centralize all recruitment and hiring policies, procedures, staffing, and organization into a new UMS HR department with appropriate staff.

Conclusion

Upon completion of this review, the University of Maine System Human Resources Office will continue to review additional aspects of the employee life cycle that include:

- Onboarding and Orientation
- Separations and Terminations
- Salary increases for employees in Management Group positions